Institutional Planning Committee Meeting Minutes

Meeting held on: May 14, 2021 @ 9:30am

In attendance:

Members:

William J. Fritz, President

Michael Parrish, Provost

VP Hope Berte

VP Jennifer Borrero

Interim VP Robert Wallace

AVP Carlos Serrano

Prof. Alyson Bardsley

Prof. Katie Cumiskey

Prof. Erlan Feria

Prof. Catherine Lavender

Prof. John Verzani

Prof. Cindy Wong

Guests:

Jessica Collura, Interim Chief of Staff/Deputy to the President

Ralf Peetz, Associate Provost

President Fritz gave opening remarks and updates on the DEI Plan.

* Updates on the Budget were provided. Budget is masked by stimulus funding, which will only last for a few years. Over the next few years, we need to reduce payroll and/or increase enrollment. Enrollment is down and payroll costs are increasing. A flat budget means we can not keep up with increased costs, even with current attrition/decrease in staff.
* Provost Parrish announced that he and AVP Alexander Scott are working on a Strategic Enrollment Plan over the Summer.
* Discussions were held on the tap gap and collections and how they might impact students of color.
* Provided an update on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Plan, which included: formation of the diversity council and reporting on the 21 Day Equity Habit Building Challenge held at the beginning of this semester for 4 weeks from February 22 through March 22.  The 21 Day Challenge began open and honest conversations that were very powerful - and many commented that they were so grateful to have and be a part of such programming on campus.  Additional programming included, Student Affairs, advancing their  "WHAT IS..?" series, partnered with HR and Academic Affairs and presented "What is Constructive Allyship?"​ with Dr. Tsedale M. Melaku’s presenting; in April, CSI Office of Sustainability partnered with others to present Cooked: Survival by Zip Code, Racism as a Public Health Crisis; in May, the division of Health Sciences partnered with others to hold a panel on Speak out Against Anti-Asian Hate; which was reported on in the SI Live. The Diversity Council is considering the idea of a unity mural for CSI. All of these programs are helping us change the narrative.  We are acknowledging that racism exists, listening and sharing our stories, understanding our history and talking about ways we can become part of the solution.  We are educating each other and, although we have a long way to go, we are heading in the right direction with each step we take.
* Vaccination requirements for students were discussed
* Discussion ensued on reopening and common misconceptions including that of our air handlers; eg: buildings designed to have safer airflow without having windows open as that interferes with operation of the system.
* Details on mask mandates, social distancing and expectations for re-entry are expected to be announced; many speculating as to what policies will be; not knowing is causing some anxiety

Provost Parrish provided information on the CSI Diversity Council

* Formation of the Diversity Council was announced, members are listed on the [website](https://www.csi.cuny.edu/about-csi/diversity-csi/office-diversity-compliance/diversity-council).
* The Council met for the first time as a group on April 13th, led by the steering committee: Michael Parrish, Catherine Ferrara and Prof. Tyehimba Jess.  They divided into subgroups, focusing on issues such as Recruitment, Retention, and Campus Climate.
* As part of their work, they will review the various recommendations for DEI initiatives proposed by the previous Council, the COACHE committee and the Rankin Survey results, as well as the Diversity Equity and Inclusion program that was presented to IPC.​
* Discussion ensued about retention being a big concern; will look at make up of sub committee assigned to retention as it lacks faculty.
* Discussion was held about compliance; its importance and the need to hold people accountable for their actions. Need to address microaggressions and such actions that result in negative outcomes.

Associate Provost, Ralf Peetz presented on the student equity gap

* Ralf and his team are analyzing and desegregating student data so that one can see student success/pass rates and where there are concerns and identify problem areas/ who is at risk. The data reveals differences in outcomes of students by racial/ethnic groups
* Discussions were held in how we can identify what the problems are / what is the cause; pedagogy, curriculum, advising, lack of support systems, factors outside of academics all raised as possible concerns
* We need to identify tools and resources to help address the issues; faculty and staff need professional development
* Ralf and his team have a multi-year plan to rollout data and address achievement gap; will put together a faculty steering work; will do substantial work with each department in the Fall.

AVP Carlos Serrano presented on the Budget

* The 3rd Quarter Report released April 26 2021 and the University is projected to end FY 2021 in a positive condition with the help of federal stimulus funds.
* With the exception of 2 senior campuses, 3 professional schools and Central Administration, all other campuses are projected to end the year in an operating deficit before applying Stimulus or CUTRA reserves; all of CUNY is in distress.
* Majority of the system will have to rely on Stimulus funds and CUTRA reserves to end in a positive balance.
* CSI is projected to end in the black by less than 100k (59k); with an operating deficit of (11.6M) and Stimulus Funds and CUTRA Resources of $11.7M
* The major factors contributing to our projected operating deficit can be attributed to combined resource reductions and unfunded cost increases which in turn is being mitigated through the use of stimulus funds.
* Collection rate are projected to end below target due to a modification in collection practice to conform with CUNY Policy (future year collections applied to current year target) and over 900 students from the Fall not returning for Spring 2021.
* The 3rd Quarter Report show minimal reductions in PS costs compared to last year which doesn’t truly reflect the savings we have achieved to date from the hiring freeze. The main reason for this is because we continue to incur unfunded mandatory cost increases.
* The headcount change information in the 3rd Qtr Financial Report depicts changes over an 18 month period (March 2021 compared to October 2019) by major function.
* Discussions were had on whether we can compare Community Colleges with Senior Colleges; and the difference in funding models; as well as lack of City funding for increased Associate students/degrees at CSI.
* Concerns were raised about keeping up with increased costs; collection rates; lack of support for fringe befits and decision not to raise tuition

VP Berte and Provost Parrish discussed re-entry

* Re-entry plans will be updated; many questions unanswered right now as we await updated CUNY policies.
* Facilities team will work with each department for reopening; HR will work with each Director regarding staffing and remote agreements/accommodations/leaves; Registrar and facilities team will work on classrooms and spacing with departments.

**IPC 5.14.21 MEETING CHAT TRANSCRIPT:**

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 09:32 AM

I have been on a very interesting Disability History conference in London since quite early this morning :)

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 09:32 AM

One of the benefits and liabilities of Zoom!

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 09:33 AM

Exactly, Michael! Recharging the research batteries :)

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 09:38 AM

It was in 1995 - an unprecedented heat wave. I was living there then,

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 09:41 AM

Redlining is a similar topic that needs discussion as well. I highly recommend going to the Mapping Inequality website (https://dsl.richmond.edu/panorama/redlining/) and looking at redlining in your community -- the EPA's Office of Environmental Justice has been having an excellent public series this year on these issues, including those addressed in Cooked.

From Jennifer Borrero to Everyone: 09:42 AM

Thanks for sharing that resource Catherine.

From jverzani to Everyone: 09:44 AM

Our share of that was not 5%. It was about 1.7M or around 1.8%. That 5% did not include tuition revenue, so it is somewhat misleading as it isn’t 5% of the tax levy allocation

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 09:45 AM

Do we continue to have a "TAP gap"?

From jverzani to Everyone: 09:50 AM

Yes, the TAP gap is closing (it moves down 500 this next budget year) and plans are for it to happen a few more years

We aren’t really in the middle. We are 2nd worst to NYCCT. But they had serious enrollment issues

In 3rd worst is city with -8.9 but their budget is bigger, so the percentage less is much less.

Payroll reductions in the report show a loss of 34 FT lines, but we lost 35 FT Faculty during this period

From Robert.Wallace to Everyone: 09:52 AM

Community Colleges facing challenges with BMCC at - 20M, and KBCC and LaG at - 15M

From jverzani to Everyone: 09:59 AM

Our collection rate is 69%; sr college average is 76%; but the comprehensives all lag this

CC’s had 42M less in tuition revenue \*\*and\*\* a 46M cut in City support. Sr. Colleges had 26M reduction in state revenue and much more robust enrollment

BMCC only spent 8% of its CRRSAA and ARPA funds; CSI spent 21%, trailing KBCC (31%, Hostos 26%, York 24.8%)

There is federal and state financial aid along with serious federal funds to help disadvantage students; we should be collecting what is owed.

Of that 39M in ARPA funds, I believe 19M is for the students…

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 10:01 AM

Alex and

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:01 AM

I would like to participant in this from a St. George perspective

\*participate

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 10:01 AM

I are working on a strategic enrollment plan over the summer.

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:01 AM

enrollment and then persistence

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:01 AM

It is about having more CC level students and fewer Sr level students That is the major shift in the past 8 years

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 10:02 AM

retention?

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:02 AM

retention, collection rate, other factors are all correlated with CC vs SR level on entry.

From Jennifer Borrero to Everyone: 10:05 AM

CSI students received $5.9M in CRRSAA funds from $225-$1125.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:06 AM

That seems right. CARES and CRRSAA had the same level of student support. The ARPA is much more.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:12 AM

My prediction: with only 60% our enrollment will continue to slump. We could be more ambitious here. The limitations at this point are more cultural than scientific.

(And yes that is an easy prediction…)

From Jennifer Borrero to Everyone: 10:12 AM

We are working with SIUH on a webinar for students to discuss vaccines. It will be held in June.

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:15 AM

Mask wearing? Social distancing?

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:15 AM

Good, Jennifer. The level of student anxiety is significant. One of my (normally not paranoid) history students stated in class that he expected those who refuse to be vaccinated will be required by the government or by the College to wear patches on their clothes, like the yellow star or pink triangle. So much paranoia. Believe me I stated no such thing would be done by our campus. The discussion could be broadened as well to discuss civil liberties and confirm our College's commitment to preserving them.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:16 AM

There are always fringe thoughts. We need to focus on the bulk, not the exception. People’s perceptions will change over the next few months

Plus once they know all about air-exchanges, they won’t have to worry

From Jennifer Borrero to Everyone: 10:17 AM

Yes, we are getting similar emails from students so we will discuss those issues.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:17 AM

I’m just saying, we can’t be driven by the fringe ideas out there in our community

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:17 AM

Of course. But what students had missed in the governor's and the Chancellor's statements was that the mandate will be enforced when the vaccines are no longer under emergency approval.

From Robert.Wallace to Everyone: 10:18 AM

Governor Cuomo reported to comment that NYS would be making a separate decision on mask usage

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:19 AM

Yes, and that decision will happen soon and will follow CDC advice. Anyone want to take that bet?

We pull data from the registry by matching name and address. Everyone vaccinated in the state gets recorded

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:19 AM

Can you type that in the chat

From Robert.Wallace to Everyone: 10:19 AM

We're also looking to see if we can have a pop up vaccination site for students at end of July/start of August

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:20 AM

Excelsior Pass?

Got it. https://covid19vaccine.health.ny.gov/excelsior-pass

From Jennifer Borrero to Everyone: 10:21 AM

Health Center has access to the Citywide Immunization Registry (CIR). For COVID-19 vaccinations of CSI students, CIR reports the following as of 5/10/21:

J&J 133

2 doses Moderna/Pfizer 3065

1 dose Moderna/Pfizer 1555

Total 4,753 students

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:22 AM

We will have to clearly communicate that students are not penalized in a blended environment for not being vaccinated

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:23 AM

At some point the vaccination will be required for enrollment in CUNY the way other vaccinations are. This too will likely happen by the fall.

We need to be flexible. These restrictions are going to be lifted sooner than later

From Robert.Wallace to Everyone: 10:26 AM

Believe John is right; appears that a mandate won't be issued until the FDA approves the vaccines. There is speculation that at least on of the vaccines will receive that approval this summer

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:26 AM

We also need to focus on RETAINING diverse faculty.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:26 AM

Yes, that is a necessary step

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 10:27 AM

I think we have been doing all on the page for a while, no?

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:27 AM

Good

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 10:29 AM

A high percentage of our lower-division courses are taught by NTT faculty; do these programs and practices include them?

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:29 AM

Michael, could you share this document with us after?

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:33 AM

#2 is really a huge problem and as it looks completely under staffed. There is on faculty member

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:38 AM

Yes, this is why #2 is so important. There needs to be a focus on retention.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:38 AM

History also has been able to hire 2 faculty members in African American history, an immigration historian who is a woman of color, and a Latin Americanist who was Latina and failed to retain any of them. It is heartbreaking.

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:39 AM

That being said, not everyone will stay. We also need a system that allows us to rehire FT faculty — not lecturers — when faculty leave. We are down 35 FT faculty a percentage only behind MEC since F19.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:42 AM

We need to communicate more clearly that compliance does not end with the search, as well.

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:42 AM

I agree 100% with the President -- we need to be even more clear about how we pursue reports of bias and hate.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:42 AM

I think it was Erlan, then Jessica, then me

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:42 AM

But even with compliance that office needs more support to ensure follow-up and closure and healing.

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 10:43 AM

That’s right Cathy - thanks

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:47 AM

Yes Erlan... we have to make an ACTIVE EFFORT to recruit BIPOC students into our labs.

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 10:49 AM

Good point Katie - One of the real values of scholarship driven education at institutions like ours is to encourage students from underserved backgrounds to participate in research/scholarship/creative activities.

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 10:50 AM

Thank you for mentioning staff, Erlan: staff are primary points of contact for our students too,

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 10:50 AM

@Michael what we are talking about in our department is that just having an open office door or making a classroom announcement is enough.

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 10:56 AM

ombudsman

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 10:56 AM

^^^^^^

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 10:56 AM

Yes, Cindy!

From jverzani to Everyone: 10:56 AM

^^^^^^

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 10:58 AM

The situations with staff and HEOs are worst. I have heard many stories that the head of the department just did nothing to solve any issues.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:00 AM

Yes, Jennifer -- and clear protection from retaliation.

From Katie Cumiskey to Everyone: 11:00 AM

I have to jump to another meeting..

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 11:00 AM

Please include the chat in the minutes.

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 11:07 AM

I am not good at Math, but why is the 6 year overall for CSI lower that all the other groups?

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:07 AM

It is lowest for asian The right bar is the overall, so must be between the extremes

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:07 AM

It's the average of the other bars in that table.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:08 AM

Not quite Cathy. It is a weighted average.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:08 AM

Thank you, John.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:08 AM

The bars would be better if they were fatter for bigger cohorts. So you would see that variability is a big factor

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 11:08 AM

Oh, I confused the two blues.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:11 AM

A big factor is whether students placed in or matriculated. It would be best to compare only those who placed in.

10% of math grades are Ds so some effect comes from that censoring.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:13 AM

So my question is what actions this points us towards -- is it an advising problem, a pedagogy problem?

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:13 AM

It is about support systems, perhaps.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:14 AM

That too, John -- I expect it is a combination of factors.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:14 AM

These students don’t take 100-level math…

I’d take point of entry into the curriculum to break out the cohorts

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 11:14 AM

The adjunct faculty's composition and training needs addressing too, given how high a percentage of lower division courses are taught by NTT faculty.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:16 AM

In 2017 there were huge changes to how students placed into math with an anticipated drop in pass rates. This helps explain some of the within department variance

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 11:16 AM

Do we have data on what levels certain students had before they arrive CSI? Maybe we can do early intervention?

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:21 AM

Curriculum is one aspect, but others are out of the control of the classroom. It might be interested to run this analysis based on commuting time; based on SES factors; to see what the strength is of those factors and what is addressable on the academic side.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:21 AM

Pedagogy is also important.

From Alyson Bardsley (she/her) to Everyone: 11:25 AM

Thank you Ralf!

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:26 AM

Thank you Ralf!

Ralf, I look forward to the discussion of how to fix that equity gap. But it's so great to have some data to help with that discussion.

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:27 AM

We are a Sr. College, the CCs are a different beast altogether with a different funding model

MEC is too small to compare; NYCCT always runs on a shoe string budget

From Ralf Peetz to Everyone: 11:28 AM

Sorry for not being able to monitor the chat. Please reach out to me directly, I would appreciate your thoughts. And from what little I saw in the chat: Every department will have a specific context and explanation for their data, and therefor a specific "recipe" to address their issues. We are trying to provide help and the appropriate tools for everyone.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:28 AM

(Here and listening but have to stretch after being in this chair since 6am and you all don't want to see that)

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 11:28 AM

We are not funded like a Senior College

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:33 AM

We are funded by the state. That is different than a CC funded by the city.

The adjunct costs did bump up a large amount due to this

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:39 AM

likely less than flat… No state support for fringe increases; no tuition increase; TAP is a plus, but not as much as tuition increases

From jverzani to Everyone: 11:45 AM

Students are set to get 19M in the ARPA funds.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:51 AM

rent moratoria

I am happy to see more Associates degrees being conferred. I just wish that the City would support those efforts as they do for the CCs.

We need a funder/underwriter for the VS like the Macaulay has.

I am hoping maybe one might arise out of the VS graduates, perhaps.

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 11:56 AM

I wanted to make Hope and Michael aware that the Central PSC is having a meeting about re-entry Thursday, May 20, 2021 - 6:30pm to 8:30pm. https://www.psc-cuny.org/calendar/psc-town-hall-safe-reopening

From Cindy Wong to Everyone: 11:56 AM

Many of the Fall classes in Media Culture labelled Hybrid has room assignments as TBA. How are we going to figure out what to do and what rooms to use?

From Michael Parrish to Everyone: 11:57 AM

For Media Culture, Cynthia C. Will (and already is) working with Hope’s team and the registrar,

From Catherine Lavender (she/her) to Everyone: 12:00 PM

But is it not that the supervisor MAY accommodate remote work requests, and that the "take annual leave" is the fallback if an agreement over accommodations cannot be arrived at?

So FMLA if you are a carer